



Committee and Date

Southern Planning Committee

20 October 2020

SOUTHERN PLANNING COMMITTEE

Minutes of the meeting held on 22 September 2020

2.00 - 5.15 pm

Meeting held virtually via Microsoft Teams Live

Responsible Officer: Tim Ward

Email: tim.ward@shropshire.gov.uk Tel: 01743 257713

Present

Councillors David Turner (Vice-Chair), Andy Boddington, Nick Hignett, Cecilia Motley, Tony Parsons, Madge Shineton, Robert Tindall, Tina Woodward, Nigel Hartin (Substitute) (substitute for Richard Huffer) and Claire Wild (Substitute) (substitute for David Evans)

130 Apologies for Absence

Apologies for absence were received Councillors David Evans, Simon Harris and Richard Huffer

Councillor Claire Wild substituted for Councillor Evans and Councillor Nigel Hartin substitute for Councillor Huffer

131 Minutes

RESOLVED:

That the Minutes of the meeting of the South Planning Committee held on 28 July 2020 be approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

132 Public Question Time

There were no public questions or statements received

133 Disclosable Pecuniary Interests

Members were reminded that they must not participate in the discussion or voting on any matter in which they had a Disclosable Pecuniary Interest and should leave the room prior to the commencement of the debate.

With reference to planning application 20/00840/REM Councillor Andy Boddington stated that as he been in discussion with the developer for two years regarding the detail of the scheme he would not take part in the debate or voting on this item. He drew Members attention to the statement he had made which had been included in the schedule of late representations.

With reference to planning applications 19/02197/FUL, 20/01796/FUL, 20/01966/FUL and 20/01997/FUL Councillor Cecilia Motley declared that she was a member of The Shropshire Hills AONB Partnership and The Shropshire Hills AONB Strategy and Performance Committee. She confirmed that she had taken no part in any discussion relating to this application.

With reference to planning applications 19/02197/FUL, 20/01796/FUL, 20/01966/FUL and 20/01997/FUL Councillor Robert Tindall declared that he was a member of The Shropshire Hills AONB Partnership and The Shropshire Hills AONB Strategy and Performance Committee. He confirmed that he had taken no part in any discussion relating to this application

With reference to planning applications 19/02197/FUL, 20/01796/FUL, 20/01966/FUL and 20/01997/FUL Councillor David Turner declared that he was a member of The Shropshire Hills AONB Partnership and The Shropshire Hills AONB Strategy and Performance Committee. He confirmed that he had taken no part in any discussion relating to this application

**134 Oaklands Leisure Campsite and Fishery Harton Shropshire SY6 7DL
(19/02197/FUL)**

In accordance with the Local Protocol for Councillors and Officers dealing with Regulatory Matters (Part 5, Paragraph 15) Councillor Cecilia Motley, local Ward Councillor, having submitted a statement, took no part in the debate and did not vote on this item.

The Consultant Planner introduced the application, which was an application under Section 73A of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 for the change of use of Pastureland/woodland to camping for up to 50 tent pitches 8 glamping units and retrospective permission for shower and toilet block, and with reference to the drawings and photographs displayed, he drew Members' attention to the location and layout of the site.

The Consultant Planner drew Members attention to the information contained in the list of late representations and read out a further representation that had been received.

In accordance with virtual meeting speaking protocol the following Public Speaker statements were read out:

- Councillor Graham Watts (Chair) on behalf of Eaton Under Heywood & Hope Bowdler Parish Council
- Councillor Cecilia Motley – Local Member (In accordance with the public speaking protocol Councillor Motley read her statement)
- Paul Madeley (Agent) on behalf of the applicant, Mr R Corfield

During the ensuing debate Members comments included: -

- Concern re length of time taken to determine application and lack of enforcement
- Concern regarding cumulative impact of proposal on local community.
- Members felt that the quality of the proposed accommodation was not of sufficient quality for a site in the AONB
- Should encourage rural tourism but not on this site.

RESOLVED:

That contrary to Officer recommendation the application be refused for the following reasons:

It is acknowledged that the provision of 50 tent pitches and 8 glamping units for holiday use would contribute to the economic objective of sustainable development through being an expansion of an existing rural business enterprise and the likely spend of the users on local goods and services, and would also contribute to the social objective by facilitating users well-being through providing a base from which to access Shropshire's historic and natural environment. However these benefits do not outweigh the harm caused to the environmental objective of sustainable development through the adverse cumulative impact of the additional tent pitches and glamping units on the setting and tranquillity of the surrounding countryside and the South Shropshire Hills Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, the glamping unit structures not being high quality visitor accommodation in their form, and because the likely disruptive impact of the intensified use upon the environmental network in the locality would not be appropriate to its location and would not protect, conserve, restore or enhance the natural environment. The development is therefore contrary to adopted Shropshire Core Strategy Policies CS5, CS6, CS16 and CS17; Site Allocation and Management of Development (SAMDev) Pan policies MD2, MD11 and MD12 and paragraphs 127, 130, 170, and 172 of the National Planning Policy Framework.

135 Land At Rocks Green Ludlow Shropshire SY8 2DS (20/00840/REM)

In accordance with the declaration made at minute 133 Councillor Andy Boddington took no part in the debate and did not vote on this item.

The Principal Planner introduced the application which was an application for the approval of reserved matters (appearance, landscaping, layout, scale) pursuant of 14/05573/OUT (access approved) for the erection of foodstore (Use Class A1) and petrol filling station; all ancillary works and with reference to the drawings and photographs displayed, he drew Members' attention to the location, layout and elevations.

The Principal Planner drew members attention to the information contained in the schedule of late representations and advised members that subsequent to the publication of the late representations Highways England had withdrawn their holding objection.

During the ensuing debate Members comments included: -

- Any lighting in the car park should be low level to avoid light pollution
- Appropriate landscaping and planting should be installed

RESOLVED:

That in accordance with the Officer recommendation planning permission be granted subject to the conditions set out in Appendix 1. And that delegated authority being given to the Area Planning Manager to adjust/add conditions as necessary including:

No works shall take place to the L-shaped barn until a European Protected Species (EPS) Mitigation Licence with respect to bats has been obtained from Natural England and submitted with the approved method statement to the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To ensure the protection of bats, which are European Protected Species.

All works to the L-shaped barn shall occur strictly in accordance with the Interim/Provisional Bat Mitigation Statement (Shropshire Wildlife Consultancy, September 2020).

Reason: To ensure the protection of and enhancements for bats, which are European Protected Species.

The lighting details submitted to comply with condition 15 of the outline planning permission 14/05573/OUT shall also be designed to take into account the advice on lighting set out in the Bat Conservation Trust's Guidance Note 08/18 Bats and artificial lighting in the UK. The development shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the approved details and thereafter retained for the lifetime of the development.

Reason: To minimise disturbance to bats, which are European Protected Species.

The deletion of drainage condition 6 and the inclusion of two replacement drainage conditions required by Highways England in withdrawing their holding objection as follows:

Prior to the installation of any on-site drainage infrastructure, an on-site SUDS Management and Maintenance Plan shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority in consultation with Highways England. The on-site drainage system shall be implemented in accordance with the approved Management and Maintenance Plan, which shall remain in place throughout the lifetime of the development.

Prior to the implementation of the approved drainage scheme, the existing site drainage connections to the highway drain along the western boundary of the site shall be permanently removed.

136 Hare Hill Farm Edgton Craven Arms Shropshire SY7 8HN (20/01796/FUL)

The Consultant Planner introduced the application which was an application for the temporary siting of static caravan for use as rural occupational dwelling and installation of septic tank, and with reference to the drawings and photographs displayed, he drew Members' attention to the location, layout and elevations.

In accordance with virtual meeting speaking protocol the following Public Speaker statements were read out:

- Janet Cobb on behalf of Edgton Parish Council
- Councillor Ruth Houghton – Local Member (In accordance with the public speaking protocol Councillor Houghton read her statement)
- Liam and Alice O'Brian, applicants

During the ensuing debate Members comments included: -

- Should support local rural food based enterprises.
- Living on site will enable them to develop their business.
- The financial test does not take account of local circumstances.

RESOLVED:

That contrary to the Officer recommendation planning permission be granted and that delegated authority being given to the Area Planning Manager to apply conditions as necessary including:

Permission be granted for a temporary period of 3 years.

Members felt that the financial test did not take account of local circumstances and that allowing the applicants to live on site would enable them to develop their business.

137 Coates Farm Ratlinghope Shrewsbury Shropshire SY5 0SS (20/01966/FUL (20/01966/FUL))

The Principal Planner introduced the application which was an application for change of use of agricultural land to allow siting of three glamping pods; installation of septic tank and creation of parking area, and with reference to the drawings and photographs displayed, he drew Members' attention to the location, layout and elevations.

In accordance with virtual meeting speaking protocol the following Public Speaker statements were read out:

- Councillor Ruth Houghton – Local Member (In accordance with the public speaking protocol Councillor Houghton read her statement)
- Shaun Jones (Agent) on behalf of the applicants

During the ensuing debate Members comments included: -

- The development would have a harmful effect on the AONB
- Nature of the location would mean increased traffic movement to access services.

RESOLVED:

The in accordance with the Officer recommendation planning permission be refused for the following reasons:

1. For reasons of location, design, layout, and access works, the development would be a conspicuous feature in the countryside and in an area of the Shropshire Hills AONB which has considerable landscape character. The development would not sufficiently integrate into its setting in a sympathetic manner. The development is therefore contrary to the guidelines of the NPPF and the requirements of the adopted Development Plan policies CS5, CS6, CS17, MD2.

2. The development is not sufficiently related to a settlement, or an established and viable tourism enterprise where accommodation is required. Visitors are likely to rely on unsustainable means of car travel. The development fails to complement the character and qualities of the site's immediate surroundings and landscape quality, and is therefore considered unsustainable tourism development, contrary to adopted Development Plan policies CS5, CS16, MD11 and MD12. There are no material considerations including economic benefits that outweigh the harm.

138 Proposed Dwelling At Site Of 3 Pentirvin Minsterley Shropshire (20/01997/FUL)

The Consultant Planner introduced the application for the Erection of a single storey, traditionally styled carbon neutral dwelling; together with siting of a treatment plant and with reference to the drawings and photographs displayed, he drew Members' attention to the location, layout and elevations.

In accordance with virtual meeting speaking protocol the following Public Speaker statements were read out:

- Sarah Smith (Clerk) on behalf of Worthen with Shelve Parish Council
- Councillor Heather Kidd – Local Member (In accordance with the public speaking protocol Councillor Kidd read her statement)
- Penny Ellison, applicant.

During the ensuing debate Members comments included: -

- Development would allow the applicant to downsize and remain in the area.
- Settlement is very spread out.
- Permitted development rights should be withdrawn.

RESOLVED:

That contrary to the Officers Recommendation planning permission be granted and that delegated authority be giving to the Planning Services Manager to agree appropriate conditions to include the removal of permitted development rights.

Members felt that whilst there were already a number of permissions granted these were for larger properties and allowing this development would allow the applicant to downsize and remain in the area. Members also took into account that there was previously a dwelling on this site and that substantial parts of the former dwelling are still present.

139 2 Rectory Court Church Road Clungunford SY7 0PN (20/02691/FUL)

In accordance with the Local Protocol for Councillors and Officers dealing with Regulatory Matters (Part 5, Paragraph 15) Councillor Nigel Hartin, local Ward Councillor, took no part in the debate and did not vote on this item.

The Principal Planner introduced the application for the erection of a potting shed and with reference to the drawings and photographs displayed, he drew Members' attention to the location, layout and elevations. He advised Members that the application had come before Committee as the applicant was a Council Officer.

RESOLVED:

That in accordance with the officer recommendation planning permission be granted subject to the conditions set out in Appendix 1

140 Schedule of Appeals and Appeal Decisions

RESOLVED:

That the Schedule of Appeals and Appeal Decisions for the southern area as at 22 September 2020 be noted.

141 Date of the Next Meeting

RESOLVED:

That it be noted that the next meeting of the South Planning Committee will be held at 2.00 pm on Tuesday, 20 October 2020

Signed (Chairman)

Date: